

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK  
COUNTY OF NEW YORK

-----X  
Michael Williams, José Ramírez-Garofalo, Aixa Torres, and  
Melissa Carty,

Index No. 164002/2025

Petitioners,

-against-

Board of Elections of the State of New York; Kristen Zebrowski Stavisky, in her official capacity as Co-Executive Director of the Board of Elections of the State of New York; Raymond J. Riley, III, in his official capacity as Co-Executive Director of the Board of Elections of the State of New York; Peter S. Kosinski, in his official capacity as Co-Chair and Commissioner of the Board of Elections of the State of New York; Henry T. Berger, in his official capacity as Co-Chair and Commissioner of the Board of Elections of the State of New York; Anthony J. Casale, in his official capacity as Commissioner of the Board of Elections of the State of New York; Essma Bagnuola, in her official capacity as Commissioner of the Board of Elections of the State of New York; Kathy Hochul, in her official capacity as Governor of New York; Andrea Stewart-Cousins, in her official capacity as New York State Senate Majority Leader and President Pro Tempore of the Senate; Carl E. Heastie, in his official capacity as Speaker of the New York State Assembly; and Letitia James, in her official capacity as Attorney General of New York,

Respondents,

-and-

Representative Nicole Malliotakis, Edward L. Lai, Joel Medina, Solomon B. Reeves, Angela Sisto, and Faith Togba,

Intervenor-Respondents.

-----X

**AFFIRMATION IN  
SUPPORT OF  
OPPOSITION TO  
MOTIONS TO DISMISS  
AND REPLY  
MEMORANDUM OF  
LAW IN SUPPORT OF  
PETITION**

ARIA C. BRANCH, an attorney duly admitted *pro hac vice* to practice before the Courts of the State of New York, hereby affirms the following under penalty of perjury:

1. I am a Partner at Elias Law Group LLP, counsel for Petitioners in this Civil Practice Law and Rules Art. 4 special proceeding.
2. I submit this Affirmation solely to present to the Court with information and materials supporting Petitioners' reply memorandum of law in support of the Petition filed on December 18, 2025 and in opposition to Respondents' Motions to Dismiss, which materials are attached hereto as described below.
3. Attached hereto as Exhibit A is a copy of the Reply Expert Report of Dr. Maxwell Palmer.
4. Attached hereto as Exhibit B is a copy of the Reply Expert Report of Dr. Thomas J. Sugrue.
5. Attached hereto as Exhibit C is a copy of the Reply Expert Report of William S. Cooper.

Dated: December 18, 2025  
Washington, D.C.



Aria C. Branch  
ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP  
250 Massachusetts Ave. NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20001  
Phone: 202-968-4518  
Fax: 202-312-5904  
abbranch@elias.law